



SDI Review Form 1.5

PART A:

Journal Name:	International Research Journal of Pure and Applied Chemistry
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012/IRJPAC/1370
Title of the Manuscript:	<i>Synthesis, spectral, magnetic and in-vitro anticancer properties of some Metal(II) complexes of 3-[2,4-dihydro-1H-inden-4-ylimino) methyl]naphthalen-2-ol</i>
Manuscript received on (Date)	
Review comment submitted (Date)	



SDI Review Form 1.5

PART B: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part and write here 'Corrected'/ if not agreed, give suitable justifications)</i>
General comment:	The same authors recently published a similar paper entitled: Synthesis, spectroscopic, anticancer, and antimicrobial properties of some metal(II) complexes of (substituted) nitrophenol Schiff base" in the Int. J.Inorg Chem 2012, doi:10.1155/2012/206417. The current paper involves Schiff base derived from naphthaldehyde, it appears all these works is fragmented. All this work could be scientifically beneficial, if the authors could synthesize a library of Schiff base ligands, complex with metals and test them on various cell lines. By doing this a correlation can be derived between the structure and activity, and may lead to Quantitative Structure Activity Relationship Study.	Even though the work appears fragmented. However, in the revised manuscript we have related the structures of the various synthesised Schiff bases (with appended aminoindane moiety) in our earlier works and the present study to their anticancer activities against both MCF-7(breast) and HT-29(colon) carcinomas. Pg 2 lines 45-47, Pg 6 line 239-257, Pg 9 line 370-373, Pg 9 line 375-378
Specific comments:		
Title and abstract	Line 5, naphthalene; line 19,	Corrected line 5, line 8
Introduction	Line 46 , line 49	Corrected line 33, line 36
Review of literature (Heading may differ in the case of review paper)	OK	
Materials & methods (Heading may differ in the case of review paper)	Line 67 naphthaldehyde; line 74, 10^{-2} in superscript; weights, moles, volume follows the name of the compound in parenthesis. Line 83,84, coupling constants must be reported for triplet and quartet. Line 100, yield should read 0.12g, 60%. Same for line 105,112; Line 110, 111, 117, 118, coupling constants for triplet and quartet.	Corrected. line 63, line 65 and line 66(10^{-2}), line 74, line 75, line 96, line 97, line 104 and line 105 (coupling constants). Line 85, line 91 and line 99 (yields),
Results & discussion (Heading may differ in the case of review paper)	Reduce discussion on NMR data, line 217 onwards....	Corrected line 213-224
Conclusion	OK	



SDI Review Form 1.5

References		
------------	--	--

Note: Anonymous Reviewer